

FSH COMMENTS 2018 9

COMMENTS TO AUTHOR: This is a touching 55 word story that recounts the participation of the physician narrator at the birth of a child in the morning and her presence with her own child at the bedside of her dying grandmother in the evening. I liked everything about the story. The title conveys the overall theme - the symmetry of life and death. The parallels and contrasts of dawn/dusk, old/new eyes, families crying (for opposite reasons), arriving/leaving/readiness are all very well done. Each of these reinforces a sense of full circle and completeness. I particularly liked the sense of readiness communicated - it suggested to me there is a rhythm to both life and death, and if we just step out of the way and let things be, in most cases nature knows what it's doing.

COMMENTS TO EDITOR: found this to be an excellent 55 word story that recounts the participation of the physician narrator at the birth of a child in the morning and her presence with her own child at the bedside of her dying grandmother in the evening. I liked everything about the story. The title conveys the overall theme - the symmetry of life and death. The parallels and contrasts of dawn/dusk, old/new eyes, families crying (for opposite reasons), arriving/leaving/readiness are all very well done. Each of these reinforces a sense of full circle and completeness. I particularly liked the sense of readiness communicated - it suggested to me there is a rhythm to both life and death, and if we just step out of the way and let things be, in most cases nature knows what it's doing.

I tend to be a compulsive editor, but in this case I could not find any different word choices that I thought would improve the story. It achieves its goal - to convey one of the most moving dimensions of family medicine - in a way that is understated yet powerful. I was emotionally touched by the two images the story creates and I suspect they will linger in my mind. If possible, I would recommend publishing the commentary; otherwise it is not completely clear that the "new doctor" is not also the narrator, and thus the sense of "birthing" resident skills is lost.